Testimony of Dr. Vincent DiMaio

EXAMINATION 12 13 BY MR. TOBY L. SHOOK: 14 Q. Dr. DiMaio, my name is Toby Shook. I 15 just have a few questions for you for this hearing. 16 What opinions have you come to testify 17 for today? 18 A. One, that the injuries incurred by 19 Mrs. Routier are those that would be incurred if one was 20 assaulted with a knife, and are not consistent with 21 self-inflicted wounds. She has shown significant blood 22 loss, and that her hemoglobin dropped two grams. She has 23 evidence of severe blunt trauma to both forearms, more on 24 the right than the left. Let's see. 25 O. Is that it? Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 4524 1 A. Well, you know, I don't know exactly 2 what questions I'm going to be asked, you know, but --3 Q. Are those the only opinions -- has one 4 of these attorneys gone over your testimony with you and 5 asked you questions about what you are coming to testify 6 to? 7 A. Yes, essentially those questions, I 8 think there were some questions asked about bleeding, you 9 know, how much do you bleed with different wounds, and 10 that sort of thing, only having to do with, again with 11 Mrs. Routier. 12 Q. Okay. The first opinion you said was, 13 that Mrs. Routier's wounds would have been, did you say 14 consistent with an assailant? 15 A. What I'm saying is that, based on the 16 location and direction of the wounds and the nature of 17 the wounds, these are the type of wounds that one would 18 get if one was assaulted, rather than self-inflicted. 19 They are not consistent with self-inflicted wounds.

20 Q. And what facts or data do you rely on

21 for that opinion?

22 A. Essentially, the photographs of the

23 wounds and the medical records. All of my opinions are

24 based on photographs of her and her wounds, the -- and

25 the medical records. So that is about it.

Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter

1 Q. Okay. And then, the other was an

2 opinion on blunt trauma to the right arm, primarily, and

3 then maybe blood loss?

4 A. You get various evidence of blood

5 loss, her hemoglobin went down from 11.6 at about 3:30 in

6 the morning, down to 9.6 the following day.

7 Q. Okay. Is that, as far as you know,

8 the extent of the opinion that you have come to testify

9 for today?

10 A. Yes, I think I have covered

11 everything. Let me think a second.

12 Q. And which attorney did you discuss it

13 with? Was it Mr. Mulder?

14 A. Well, my original conversation was

15 with Mr. Parks when he was originally -- he was the one

16 who originally retained me, and then I discussed it with

17 Mr. Mulder as well.

18 Q. Okay.

19

20 THE COURT: All right.

21 MR. TOBY L. SHOOK: Is that as far as

22 it goes?

23 THE COURT: Any objection?

24 MR. DOUGLAS MULDER: I think so --

25 that is pretty close, yeah.

Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 4526

1 MR. TOBY L. SHOOK: That's all then,

2 Judge.

3 THE COURT: All right. Any objection?

4 MR. DOUGLAS MULDER: We have none.

5 THE COURT: I didn't think so. What

6 about you, Mr. Shook?

7 MR. TOBY L. SHOOK: No, sir.

8 THE COURT: All right. Thank you,

9 Doctor.

10 Bring the jury in, please.

11

12 (Whereupon, the jury

13 Was returned to the

14 Courtroom, and the

15 Proceedings were

16 Resumed on the record,

17 In open court, in the

18 Presence and hearing

19 Of the defendant,

20 As follows:)

21

22 THE COURT: All right. Ladies and

23 gentlemen, let the record reflect that all parties from 24 the trial are present and the jury is seated. Ladies and 25 gentlemen of the jury, this witness has been sworn Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 4527

1 outside of your presence. 2 Mr. Mulder. 3 MR. DOUGLAS MULDER: Yes, sir. 4 THE COURT: 5 6 7 8 9 Whereupon, 10 11 DR. VINCENT J. M. DIMAIO, 12 13 was called as a witness, for the Defense, having been 14 first duly sworn by the Court to speak the truth, the 15 whole truth, and nothing but the truth, testified in open 16 court, as follows: 17 18 **19 DIRECT EXAMINATION** 20 21 BY MR. DOUGLAS MULDER: 22 Q. You are Dr. Vincent DiMaio? 23 A. Yes, sir. 24 Q. And will you tell the jury your 25 profession? Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 4528 1 A. I am a physician, presently employed 2 as the chief medical examiner for Bexar County. 3 Q. You are a medical doctor? 4 A. Yes, sir. I graduated from medical 5 school in 1965 from the State University of New York, 6 Downstate Medical Center. 7 Q. Dr. DiMaio, do you have a specialty in 8 the field of medicine? 9 A. Yes, sir. I am a specialist in the 10 overall branch of medicine called pathology which is the 11 study and diagnosis of diseases. Then I have a 12 subspecialty in forensic pathology, which is essentially 13 a branch of medicine concerned with the application of 14 all aspects of medical science, the problems and the law. 15 Q. Doctor, are you board certified? 16 A. Yes, I am board certified in

17 anatomical pathology, clinical pathology and forensic

18 pathology.

19 Q. Does a pathologist also perform

20 autopsies?

21 A. Yes, sir.

22 Q. And will you give the jury some idea

23 of how many autopsies you have performed?

24 A. I would say that I've performed

25 somewhere over 7,000 autopsies, and supervised maybe

Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter

4529

1 about 21,000, in addition.

2 Q. For how many years have you been the

3 chief medical examiner for the county of Bexar?

4 A. Since March the 1st, 1981, so it will

5 be 16 years come the end of February.

6 Q. And Dr. DiMaio, will you please

7 outline for the jury your education and professional

8 experience for the position that you now hold?

9 A. Yes, sir. After graduating from

10 medical school and obtaining my M.D. Degree, I spent four

11 years additional training in the fields of anatomical

12 pathology, and clinical pathology at Duke Hospital in

13 Durham, North Carolina, and the King's County Downstate

14 Medical Center, in New York City.

15 I then spent the fifth year of

16 training in the field of forensic pathology at the Office

17 of the Chief Medical Examiner for the State of Maryland.

18 Following this, I took my board exams

19 in '70 and '71 and was certified as a specialist in the

20 three fields of anatomical pathology, clinical pathology,

21 and forensic pathology.

22 I then went into the military, I

23 served two years in the Army, assigned to the Armed

24 Forces Institute of Pathology in Washington, D.C. where I

25 was chief of the medical legal section for one year, and

Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 4530

1 chief of the wound ballistics for another year. Then I

2 got out of the service, and I moved to Texas. I took the

3 position as a medical examiner in Dallas. I was there

4 from around June the 1st, '72 to, as I said, March the

5 1st of 1981. I was the medical examiner there and

6 eventually ended up as the Deputy Chief Medical Examiner

7 for Dallas County.

8 That is about it.

9 Q. All right. Now, Doctor, there is a

10 magazine or journal in the field of forensics, forensic

11 medicine. Are you familiar with the American Journal of
12 Forensic Medicine and Pathology?
13 A. Yes. The American Journal of Forensic
14 Medicine and Pathology is the only medical journal
15 devoted to the field of forensic pathology published in
16 the United States.
17 Q. Would you tell us who the editor in
18 chief is?
19 A. I am the editor in chief.
20 Q. Okay. How long have you been editor
21 in chief?
22 A. I think this is the 6th year.
23 Q. You have published books in the past,
24 have you not?
25 A. I have published three books. I was
Sandra M. Halsay, CSP. Official Court Peporter

Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 4531

1 the editor of one book on forensic pathology. I wrote a

2 book on gunshot wounds, which has been published. And I

3 am also the co-author with my father, who is the Chief

4 Medical Examiner in New York City, on a book called,

5 Forensic Pathology, which kind of covers all the other

6 areas of forensic pathology except for gunshot wounds,

7 which I covered in the other book.

8 Q. In addition to your father, you have

9 other pathologists in the family, do you not?

10 A. Actually, I -- well, yes, I guess

11 that's right. The older of my three sisters is a

12 pathologist and my son is a pathologist in Houston,

13 hospital pathology, he is not interested in forensics.

14 Q. You also have a sister who is a

15 pediatrics physician?

16 A. No, two sisters in pediatrics.

17 Q. Two, excuse me. Doctor, in addition

18 to the books, you have published 70 or 80 articles, have

19 you not?

20 A. 70 articles, 7 book chapters and 10 or

21 11 professional scientific letters.

22

23

24 (Whereupon, the following

25 mentioned item was

Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 4532

1 marked for

2 identification only as

3 Defendant's Exhibit No. 94,

4 after which time the

5 proceedings were 6 resumed on the record 7 in open court, as 8 follows:) 9 10 BY MR. DOUGLAS D. MULDER: 11 Q. I have marked for identification and 12 record purposes as Defendant's Exhibit 94, your CV, which 13 would acquaint the jurors with your background and 14 qualifications? 15 A. Yes, sir. 16 Q. All right. 17 18 MR. DOUGLAS MULDER: We will offer 19 into evidence what has been marked and identified as 20 Defendant's Exhibit No. 94. 21 MR. TOBY L. SHOOK: No objection. 22 THE COURT: Defendant's Exhibit 94 is 23 admitted. 24 25 (Whereupon, the item Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 4533 1 Heretofore mentioned 2 Was received in evidence as 3 Defendant's Exhibit No. 94 4 For all purposes, 5 After which time, the 6 Proceedings were resumed 7 As follows:) 8 9 10 (Whereupon, the following 11 mentioned items were 12 marked for 13 identification only 14 as Defendant's Exhibits 15 No. 82, 83, 84, 85, 86, 16 87, 88, 89, 90, 91, 17 92, 93 and 95, 18 after which time the 19 proceedings were 20 resumed on the record 21 in open court, as 22 follows:) 23 24 MR. DOUGLAS MULDER: Your Honor, at 25 this time, I'm going to offer into evidence what has been

4534 1 marked and identified as Defendant's Exhibits 82, 83, 84, 2 85, 86, 87, 88, 89, 90, 91, 92, 93 and 95? 3 THE COURT: Any objection? 4 MR. TOBY L. SHOOK: Wait a minute. 5 What is 93? 6 MR. DOUGLAS MULDER: 93 was Dr. Santos 7 report. I think it was already in. I just couldn't find 8 it. 9 MR. TOBY L. SHOOK: No objection. 10 THE COURT: All right. Defendant's 11 Exhibits 82, 83, 84, 85, 86, 87, 88, 89, 90, 91, 92, 93 12 and 95 are admitted. 13 14 (Whereupon, the above 15 Mentioned items were 16 Received in evidence 17 As Defendant's Exhibits 18 No. 82, 83, 84, 85, 86, 87, 19 88, 89, 90, 91, 92, 93 and 95 20 For all purposes, after 21 Which time, the 22 Proceedings were 23 Resumed on the record, 24 In open court, 25 As follows:) Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 4535 1 2 BY MR. DOUGLAS MULDER:

Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter

3 Q. Doctor, so that we might identify

4 these exhibits, Defendant's Exhibit 93 is an operative

5 record that was dictated by Dr. Patrick Dillawn, and also

6 bears the name of Alex Santos?

7 A. Yes, sir.

8 Q. All right. And you have had that in

9 the past, a copy of that to refer to?

10 A. Yes, I have.

11 Q. Okay. And then Defendant's Exhibit

12 No. 95 is a Polaroid photograph that has been admitted

13 into evidence that is dated 6-6-of 96, at 16:05 hours,

14 which would be, I suspect military time, for 4:05 P.M. of

15 Darlie Routier. This picture was taken June the 6th of

16 1996. I'm sorry. Can you see it now?

17 A. Yes. Okay.

18 Q. Also, you have had occasion to see

19 that, have you not?

20 A. Yes, I have.

21 Q. All right. And, could you come up

22 here so that Richard, and John maybe, so we can show the

23 jury the various photographs that we're talking about?

24 Maybe each could hold three or four.

25

Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 4536

1 MR. DOUGLAS MULDER: Judge, I just

2 want them generally to be familiar with the photographs

3 that we have here.

4 THE COURT: I understand. All right.

5 Maybe we could get in line in order so we don't inundate 6 the jury.

7 MR. RICHARD C. MOSTY: Should I be at

8 the end?

9 THE COURT: Well, let's put it at the

10 other side. We would never place you at the end.

11 MR. DOUGLAS MULDER: I said the ones

12 in the hospital are June the 6th, the Polaroid is June

13 the 6th, and the deals where she is standing in clothing

14 other than hospital, are June the 10th.

15

16 BY MR. DOUGLAS MULDER:

17 Q. Dr. DiMaio, in reviewing Defendant's

18 Exhibit No. 93, that is the operative report, did you

19 determine from that report that Darlie Routier had

20 experienced considerable blood loss?

21 A. The -- yes, sir. That in conjunction

22 with the lab reports. That is, the report by Dr. Santos

23 describes an incised wound, running down the right side

24 of the neck onto the chest, and then a continuation on

25 the left side of the chest.

Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 4537

1 And, he indicates that the -- he calls

2 it a laceration, it's really an incised wound, a cut --

3 extend down to the sheath of the carotid artery, and this

4 is almost like a thin, transparent membrane, the best way

5 to think of it, it looks like Saran Wrap, so, that was

6 wrapping the vessel, and it is about a millimeter thick,

7 there may be a little more there.

8 So, essentially, you are talking about

9 a cut that went down to, virtually, the wall of the

10 carotid artery. And, if it had severed the carotid

11 artery, she would have bled to death, because the blood

12 would have pumped out in a matter of a few minutes and

13 there would have been death.

14 When you look at the rest of the
15 medical records, they indicate that when she came into
16 the hospital, she had a blood hemoglobin, that is the
17 amount of -- that is kind of a measurement, the amount of
18 hemoglobin that you have in your blood.
19 A blood hemoglobin level of about 11.6
20 and this is about 3:30 in the morning. Then by the next
21 day, it had dropped two points, from 11.6 down to 9.6,
22 and what happened was is that she had lost a significant
23 amount of blood from this injury. And -- but it's not
24 initially reflected. That is, what happens is that when
25 you lose blood, your body compensates for it by
Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter
4538

1 mobilizing fluid from outside the bloodstream and pours 2 it in.

3 In addition, when you go to the

4 hospital, you know, they run those IV's, they are putting

5 in fluids. So what happened is, is that her hemoglobin 6 appeared relatively normal when she came in, because the 7 blood not been diluted by the fluids. The fluids came

/ blood not been diluted by the fluids. The fluids came

8 in, it dropped. And what it meant was, that she had lost 9 a significant amount of blood from these wounds. And in

10 fact, one of the diagnosis was acute posthemorrhagic

11 anemia, which meant she lost a lot of blood.

12 So this, these wounds were not, you

13 know, that and the other wounds on the arm, caused a drop

14 of two points in her hemoglobin, which is a significant

15 drop.

16 Q. Okay. Dr. DiMaio, what is your

17 evaluation as regards to the seriousness of that neck

18 wound?

19 A. About another millimeter or two, and

20 she would have been dead. It would have cut right

21 through the carotid artery.

22 In theory, you could put pressure on

23 to stop it, but, you know, in a real life situation,

24 people aren't trained like physicians, and she would have 25 bled to death.

Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 4539

1 It's -- the carotid artery, or the two

2 carotid arteries deliver 75 percent of the blood going to

3 your head. So, she would have lost approximately 40

4 percent of the blood supply going to her head. And every

5 time her heart beat, there would have been a pulse of

6 blood shooting out the neck, four or five feet, if she

7 had cut the carotid artery. And, the cut was, as I said,

8 down to the sheath, a millimeter thick, maybe.

9 Q. Dr. DiMaio, have you had the

10 opportunity to view the photographs taken of Darlie

11 Routier on June the 6th, there in the hospital?

12 A. Yes, sir.

13 Q. And, have you also had occasion to

14 review and evaluate the photographs where she is in, not

15 in hospital garb but in regular civilian clothes, shorts,

16 I believe, the photographs that were taken on June the

17 10th of 1996?

18 A. Yes, sir.

19 Q. Okay. Do the bruises on June the 10th

20 of 1996 demonstrate bruising?

21 A. Yes. I mean, if you look at her arms

22 on the 10th, you can see there is just massive soft

23 tissue hemorrhage.

24 This is her right arm. And what it is

25 going from the wrist right up to past the elbow and into

Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter

4540

1 the upper arm, so it's going, just sweeping, all the way

2 here on what you would call the plexor surface of the

3 arm, not on the back. And this is extensive hemorrhage.

4 And it appears to be a few days old, because it's

5 turning, it's a good purple color, and it's indicative of 6 severe, blunt trauma.

7 This, you know, everyone bumps into

8 something, an edge or something and gets a little bruise,

9 but just think about, if you have gotten one little

10 bruise, how much force must have been generated, must

11 have been put against this arm to cause the whole arm

12 from the wrist past the elbow, to be bruised.

13 So that is a lot of force. And so

14 there is evidence of really severe injury, and there is

15 like a little, a few little, what appears to be scrapes

16 here, indicating that there was an impact with something.

17 So, you're talking again of severe

18 force. The left arm -- again, this is the right -- the

19 left arm is not too bad. You can see it's going upward

20 to maybe a third to half a way up the forearm on this 21 surface.

22 Q. Doctor, you have noted, that no doubt,

23 that there is evidence in the photograph you have in your

24 left hand or just put down there on it, of a line, an

25 arterial line in her left wrist?

Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter

4541

1 A. Yes, sir.

2 Q. And also, an IV in her, I guess, what

3 is that, the inside of the left elbow?

4 A. Yes, sir. Right. Yes.

5 Q. That's what I call it.

6 A. All right. That is good enough.

7 Q. All right. At least --

8 A. At the cubital fossa, let's use the

9 crease.

10 Q. Is that bruising, in your judgment and

11 experience, is that a result of medical intervention?

12 A. No. The bruising here -- I mean, I --

13 at one time I actually treated live people. I started

14 IV's. That was the day before we had disposable needles,

15 and those needles were dull.

16 I can tell you, I perforated vessels

17 and there was blood, and you did not get this massive

18 hemorrhage into the arms.

19 And I have had IV's started on me,

20 where they have poked through, and you don't get it.

21 This is blunt force injury, and it's deep, it's deep down

22 into the muscle. And so, it was deep down and then

23 gradually the blood percolates up to the surface

24 underneath the skin.

25 Q. Doctor, directing your attention to

Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 4542

1 the right arm, the photographs that depict the right arm?

2 A. Yes, sir.

3 Q. And, you will notice two stab wounds

4 in the right forearm?

5 A. Yes, sir.

6 Q. One of some two inches in length and

7 the other, of approximately a half inch in length?

8 A. Yes, sir.

9 Q. Do you have an opinion with respect to

10 whether or not the bruising associated with the right arm

11 was caused by those two stab wounds?

12 A. No. Stab wounds in those locations

13 would not produce that massive bleeding into the arm.

14 And in fact, if you even use a

15 little -- if you think about it, look at where they are.

16 They are on the back, and on the back, there is not much

17 bleeding. Where is all of the bleeding? Let's see,

18 excuse me.

19 There's so many, I have got to juggle

20 these things. It's on the other side. So, these stab

21 wounds have nothing to do with the bleeding in the arm.

22 Q. All right. Doctor, what sort of

23 instrument caused those injuries?24 A. The two penetrating wounds in the --25 Q. No. No. That caused the bruising?Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter4543

1 A. It would have to be something blunt. 2 By blunt, I mean it doesn't have sharp -- it's not a 3 knife, it's not something with very sharp margins. 4 It could be blows from a fist, because 5 your fist is considered a blunt object. It could be 6 blows from a hard object, people always like baseball 7 bats, things like that. 8 It could be anything that is heavy, 9 that doesn't have any cutting edges and that can be, that 10 could impact hard against the arm, so to cause all this 11 bleeding in this area. 12 Q. Are those injuries consistent and 13 compatible with Darlie Routier having been severely 14 beaten with a blunt, heavy instrument? 15 A. Yes. That is what they are. These 16 are blunt force injuries. Impacting something very hard 17 that produced extensive bleeding into her muscle. 18 Q. Are those injuries consistent and 19 compatible, those shown in the photographs of June the

20 10th, of 1996, are those consistent and compatible, the

21 bruises evidenced in those photographs, with having been

22 received by Darlie Routier during the early morning hours

23 of June the 6th of 1996, some four days or so earlier?

24 A. Yes, sir. The coloration is

25 appropriate, and it is consistent with it.

Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 4544

1 Q. Okay. Dr. DiMaio, are those injuries

2 consistent or inconsistent with having been

3 self-inflicted, the bruising?

4 A. That is -- I would say it's

5 inconsistent. I mean, how do you get blunt force

6 injuries here? I mean, it's easy to get blunt force

7 injuries here, if you want, you know, I can bang my arm

8 against the edge here. But to here? And, also, again,

9 it's very wide spread.

10 I mean this, this, a lot of force.

11 You -- everybody has bumped into something and you get a

12 bruise, but look at this. It's just really severe

13 hemorrhage up and down the arm. This is tremendous

14 force.

15 Q. Doctor, what are defensive wounds?

16 A. Defensive wounds are injuries that you

17 get when you try to ward off an attacker. And, the18 original description had to do with knives, and it could19 also be blunt force.20 In other words, if somebody is21 swinging something hard at you like a hard object, and22 you put your arm up like that and you get injuries here23 and here, then you have what is called defensive wounds,24 because they are incurred when you try to protect25 yourself. And people will typically protect the most

Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 4545

1 important part of the body, that is the head. So people

2 tend to raise arms up, if it's a blunt force, and try to

3 protect their face and head.

4 Q. Doctor, I'll ask you to refer to the

5 photographs and see if they don't depict an injury to the

6 neck of Darlie Routier, an injury, a stab wound to the

7 left chest of Darlie Routier, cuts to the left, inside

8 fingers to three of her fingers on her left hand, and two 9 stab wounds in her right forearm?

10 A. Yes, sir.

11 Q. All right. Would you characterize any

12 of those injuries as defensive wounds?

13 A. The wounds that you would consider

14 defensive would be the wounds of the back of the right

15 forearm. This is a close-up in my right hand. This is

16 the type of wound that if somebody was trying to stab at

17 you with a knife, what do you do? You put your am up.

18 And there are two stab wounds here and here.

19 If she had been dead, and I had done

20 an autopsy, I would have called -- I would have put this

21 section down as two penetrating stab wounds of the right

22 forearm, parenthesis, defense wounds. Because this is

23 the location that you get these wounds in, if somebody is

24 going to attack you with a knife. It's typical.

25 That is, people who commit suicide

Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 4546

1 will cut themselves here. Why? Because this is the

2 natural way to do it. Although, they cut the edge, this

3 way. But these are vertically oriented, you know, on the

4 hands in its normal position, and on the back. And this

5 is typical for the defense wounds, when someone is coming

6 at you with a knife and you hold your arm up in the front

7 of you, and this is where you would get the defense

8 wounds.

9 Q. Okay.

10 A. And the other place you get defense

11 wound are on the hands. In fact, the original

12 description of defense wounds is on the hands.

13 Because what happens is someone comes

14 at you with a knife, you try to ward them off, a lot of

15 times they try to grab the blade, and you can see there

16 is a cut going across, a very superficial cut going from

17 one finger to the other and there. This has the

18 appearance of one single cut.

19 All right. I know someone says,

20 "Well, they don't exactly line up," but you know, your

21 fingers, you don't walk around with your hand like that,

22 I mean, you curl them and then maybe down or up. And

23 this has the appearance, again of a defense wound.

24 Again, if this was an autopsy case, I

25 would put, you know, incised wounds of fingers,

Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 4547

1 parenthesis, defense wounds.

2 Q. Okay. Dr. DiMaio, have you had

3 occasion in the past to examine injuries or render an

4 opinion as regards to whether or not those injuries were 5 self-inflicted?

6 A. Yes. The last time I think was about,

7 just before Christmas. A nurse shot her, I think it was

8 common-in-law husband, and her defense was is that he

9 attacked her with a knife. And, you know, they were

10 obviously self-inflicted wounds.

11 And my office has had two other -- in

12 the last three or four years, two other cases where the

13 defense was, you know, it was self-defense, and I had

14 to -- I warded off a knife, and these are defense wounds,

15 you know, these wounds were incurred, but actually they

16 were incised wounds.

17 One was, I think, an oral surgeon,

18 another one, a dentist. And again, I had another case of

19 a doctor who self-inflicted wounds and was trying to say 20 he was attacked.

21 Q. All right. Dr. DiMaio, assume that

22 Darlie Routier is right-handed, are those injuries that

23 you observed in the photographs, are they consistent or

24 inconsistent with self-infliction?

25 A. They are inconsistent with

Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 4548

1 self-infliction. Both the wounds, the stab wounds on the

2 back of the right forearm and the stab wounds on the

3 neck. Because if you look at the -- really, incised

4 wounds. When I say incised, I mean a cut.

5 And, an incised wound is when, you 6 know, the sharp edge of a knife runs across her body, but 7 a stab wound is the tip going into it. And, you can see 8 here and here (demonstrating), then if we go close up, 9 this is a much better close-up. 10 And what this shows, is that this 11 wound has started on the right side of her neck here, 12 across the midline going in a downward path, and then, 13 there is a gap and then there is a second wound. 14 So essentially, if you look at me, 15 there is an incised wound going like this, gap, and then 16 there is another knife wound here. And, you know, if you 17 think -- the ruler -- think about this. 18 If this is a knife and you're 19 right-handed, I mean, you are going to have to be going 20 like this, the edge of the knife, and then skipping a 21 place, like that, then, changing hands and doing two stab 22 wounds here, this way. 23 And, because, you know, people don't 24 do things the hard way. They do things simple. So, 25 this, you know, try and say, you know, you are going to Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 4549 1 cut like this, and then you have to cut like that, and 2 then stab, doesn't make any sense for self-inflicted 3 wounds, for a right-handed person. 4 And people who are right-handed use 5 their right hand for self-infliction of the wounds, 6 because you don't think about it. If I handed any of you 7 this, you would pick it up with your dominant hand. You 8 wouldn't think anything. 9 You wouldn't pick it up with your left 10 hand and manipulate it. It's too difficult. And people 11 don't think about that. They are not going to say, "Oh, 12 I'm going to switch hands." Now, like I said, the people 13 I saw were doctors and nurses and they self-inflicted 14 with the right hand, which was their dominant. 15 The wound on the neck is -- if I may 16 demonstrate on you? 17 O. Sure. 18 THE WITNESS: May I, your Honor? 19 THE COURT: That is quite all right. 20 MR. DOUGLAS MULDER: That is why I got

21 the ruler.

22

23 (Whereupon, the witness

24 Stepped down from the

25 Witness stand, and

Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 4550

1 Approached the jury rail 2 And the proceedings were 3 Resumed as follows:) 4 5 THE WITNESS: As I said, this, and 6 then you have to turn it like this, doesn't make any 7 sense. But that makes sense, or, that make sense. Okay? 8 And, what happens, you notice how he 9 cringed? Well, let's go in slow motion. The knife comes 10 here, and starts to cut, and what will you do, you'll 11 lean back. 12 And of course, when you lean back, 13 there's a gap, but you stick your chest out and you get 14 here. So it's like this, now lean back and so there is a 15 gap. Stand straight. 16 MR. DOUGLAS MULDER: Okay. 17 THE WITNESS: The cut comes down like 18 that, and now you start to go back. And notice how you 19 get a skip, and if you look at these wounds, they line 20 up. 21 22 BY MR. DOUGLAS MULDER: 23 Q. Would that be the same if I were --24 could you demonstrate that same thing if I were lying on 25 a sofa? Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 4551 1 A. Sure. It's the same thing. Well, it 2 doesn't make everybody horizontal, but it's the same way. 3 If you look at this, this is one wound coming straight 4 down this way. It's coming from here, gap, space. 5 And this is not consistent with 6 someone self-inflicting it with the right hand. I mean, 7 obviously, you can't stab yourself in the back. And 8 people who do self-inflict wounds, will always use their 9 dominant hand, because that is how you are taught to use 10 knives and things. 11 12 THE COURT: Thank you, Doctor. All 13 right. We will recess for lunch now. Until 10 minutes 14 after 1:00 o'clock. 15 All right. Same instructions to the 16 jury as always: Don't discuss the case among yourselves, 17 or with anyone. Do no investigation on your own. If you

18 see any publicity about the case either on radio or T.V.,

19 newspapers, please ignore it. Thank you.

20 21 (Whereupon, a short 22 recess was taken, after 23 which time, the 24 proceedings were 25 resumed in open court, Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 4552 1 in the presence and 2 hearing of the 3 Defendant, being 4 represented by his 5 Attorney, but outside of 6 the presence of the jury 7 as follows:) 8 9 THE COURT: Are both sides ready to 10 bring the jury back in and resume the trial? 11 MR. DOUGLAS D. MULDER: Yes, sir. 12 MR. GREG DAVIS: Yes, sir, the State 13 is ready. 14 THE COURT: All right. Bring the jury 15 in, please. 16 Will the Court come to order, please. 17 THE BAILIFF: Please have a seat. 18 19 (Whereupon, the jury 20 was returned to the 21 courtroom, and the 22 proceedings were 23 resumed on the record, 24 in open court, in the 25 presence and hearing Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 4553 1 of the defendant, 2 as follows:) 3 4 THE COURT: All right. Let the record 5 reflect that all parties in the trial are present and the 6 jury is seated. 7 Mr. Mulder. 8 MR. DOUGLAS MULDER: Yes, sir. 9 10 11 DIRECT EXAMINATION (Resumed) 12 13 BY MR. DOUGLAS MULDER:

14 Q. Dr. DiMaio, are you familiar with 15 blood pattern interpretation? 16 A. To a certain degree, yes, sir. 17 Q. And Dr. DiMaio, as a medical doctor, 18 what aspects and variables from a medical standpoint must 19 be taken into consideration in blood pattern 20 interpretation? 21 22 MR. TOBY L. SHOOK: Judge -- excuse 23 me, Doctor -- could we approach the bench for one moment? 24 THE COURT: You may. 25 Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 4554 1 (Whereupon, a short 2 discussion was held 3 at the side of the 4 bench, between the Court, 5 and the attorneys for 6 both sides in the case, 7 off the record, and outside 8 of the hearing of the 9 Jury, after which time, 10 the proceedings were 11 resumed on the record. 12 in the presence of 13 the jury as follows:) 14 15 THE COURT: Okay. Thank you. Go 16 ahead. 17 18 BY MR. DOUGLAS MULDER: 19 Q. Dr. DiMaio, what are the variables 20 that have to be taken into consideration from a medical 21 doctor's standpoint in blood pattern interpretation? 22 A. Okay. Essentially, bleeding is not a 23 simplistic thing. So, if you have -- some people think, 24 you know, if you cut yourself or you have a wound, 25 everybody bleeds the same. But there are a lot of things Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 4555 1 that go into how you bleed. 2 One of the simplest is, it has to do 3 with what is called, the Langer's lines, the elastic 4 fibers in your skin.

5 We all know as we get older, our skin

6 sags. And what happens is is that in the skin, beneath

7 the skin, there are elastic fibers and they make the skin

8 very contract, you know, contractile.

9 And, they run certain ways through the

10 body. And, have you ever seen anyone with a vertical

11 scar on their forehead, you notice how it stands out, but

12 then you see people who have horizontal scars and it gets

13 lost in the normal folds.

14 And plastic surgeons take advantage of

15 these elastic fibers to hide their scars. And so, if

16 you -- let's say you have been stabbed. Suppose you get

17 stabbed, if you get stabbed perpendicular to Langer's

18 lines, the elastic fibers pull open the wound and you get

19 a lot of blood coming out, if there is a vessel

20 underneath that is spurting, it will spurt out.

21 If you cut along the fibers, the wound

22 tends to be slit-like and it may not begin bleeding

23 immediately, or if it does bleed, it will not bleed as

24 much as the vertical one.

25 Then you have to take other factors.

Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter

4556

1 Right beneath the skin in most parts of the body, you

2 have muscle. And everybody has had a muscle cramp, you

3 know, when the muscle contracts down.

4 Suppose you get a stab wound in the

5 chest here, through the muscle. Is the stab wound

6 parallel or perpendicular to Langer's lines? Then when

7 it goes in, is it running with the muscle or against it?

8 If it's running against the muscle, the wound will gape 9 open.

10 If it's running with the muscle, it

11 will be slit-like. And then you are irritating the

12 muscle, will it go into a cramp and shut down and reduce

13 the amount of bleeding?

14 Then, suppose you do have a stab wound

15 going through here. And then suppose you move your arm

16 or maybe your arm had already been moved in an unusual

17 position when you had the wound, and now you moved it

18 back, the muscle can slide over, and there could be

19 contraction.

20 So, a simple stab wound may not be

21 simple. The amount of bleeding may be determined by

22 Langer's lines, the elasticity of the skin, whether you

23 are cutting against the muscle or with the muscle,

24 whether the muscle contracts down.

25 And then, when you get into a body

Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter

4557

1 cavity, do you hit a large vessel? Does the bleeding 2 from the large vessel go into the cavity first, and then 3 leak out? Or does it -- is the vessel so close to the 4 surface that it pulsates out? 5 Then, of course, you have clothing. 6 You have, say, a shirt like that. You get a stab wound 7 here and then the clothing shifts, or maybe the clothing 8 had been pulled over when you got the stab wound. 9 Now the clothing shifts over it. And 10 so that affects the way you're bleeding. So the concept 11 people have is you get a wound and the blood comes out in 12 a simple pattern. It is not that simple. 13 There are a number of factors that can 14 determine how much blood comes out, how fast, and whether 15 it comes out in spurts or kind of dribbles out, and 16 unfortunately, some people don't take that into account 17 in bloodstain interpretation and that is the Achilles 18 heel of bloodstain interpretation. 19 It makes an assumption that is not 20 true. That all wounds are equal, all wounds bleed the 21 same, and that you can -- you have -- you are starting 22 out with a fixed concept, or fixed concept and then you 23 can interpret, and it doesn't always happen that way. 24 On top of that, you will actually get 25 certain areas of the body where you will get a wound, you Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 4558

1 may not get any bleeding because the initial response to 2 the shock is contraction down of the blood vessels. Even 3 if you have like a major artery, like the carotid artery. 4 If you cut it, suppose you don't cut it all the way, you 5 only cut it part of the way, and then someone else gets 6 it cut all the way. Which wound is worse? 7 Actually, it's the wound where you 8 only cut part of the way, because if you cut it 9 completely through, an artery, which is elastic like 10 that, may go into contraction and may actually shut off 11 both ends for a short time before it pulsates. 12 But if you cut it open, you maintain 13 the open lumen of the vessel and the blood keeps pumping 14 out. So the thing is bleeding and wounds and how the 15 blood comes out is complex and it's not simple, and to 16 try to assume everybody and every wound will bleed the 17 same, doesn't work out. And again, that is the Achilles 18 heel. 19 Q. So, I guess what you are saying is 20 that, when somebody gets a stab wound or a puncture 21 wound, the body doesn't always bleed like water runs out 22 of faucet, when you turn the faucet on.

23 A. Right. It depends on, again, all of

24 these factors, including clothing, whether it's with the 25 grain, against the grain, whether it's muscle, whether Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 4559

1 you hit a vessel, there's a whole bunch of things. And

- 2 you can only generalize, but it may not actually, what
- 3 you may say, may not apply in this case. But you can
- 4 just get a general feel.
- 5 Q. Dr. DiMaio, have you seen many victims
- 6 of stab wounds?
- 7 A. Yes. I would say a couple hundred in
- 8 the last few years.
- 9 Q. Let me show you what's been marked for
- 10 identification and record purposes as State's Exhibit No.
- 11 25.
- 12 A. Yes, sir.
- 13 Q. And it has quite a number of holes
- 14 that are taken for evidence purposes. But it also has a
- 15 hole here, a defect here, and it has a defect here, and
- 16 it has a defect here.
- 17 I was thinking there were four of
- 18 those defects, but at any rate, here, here and here. Do
- 19 you routinely find defects in clothing worn by a victim
- 20 where there is no corresponding stab wound or cut on the
- 21 body itself?
- 22 A. All the time.
- 23 Q. How is that?
- 24 A. Because essentially, what you are
- 25 talking in most cases, it's not just somebody sticking a

Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 4560

- 1 knife in. There is a struggle. And you try to grab
- 2 people, and most stabbings are close combat.
- 3 Suppose you grab a shirt like this,
- 4 and you pull it, and then a knife blade comes toward you,
- 5 and you pull back, so it cuts the material.
- 6 But, let's put it this way: I would
- 7 say that maybe a quarter of all cases, you will find a
- 8 little tear, you know, of multiple stab wound cases, a
- 9 little tear, a point where the tip of the knife has gone
- 10 through, and even a slash, and on the body it doesn't
- 11 correspond.
- 12 Because what's happened is, during the
- 13 struggle the clothing has been pulled away, or it --
- 14 maybe just hangs down, and so, when someone slashes the
- 15 knife, it catches the material, but it doesn't go in deep
- 16 enough to cut the body.

17 So that's just common, all the time 18 you will find defects in the clothing, and no injury to 19 the underlying body. An examination of the clothing at 20 the time of the autopsy is part of the autopsy. 21 In my autopsy reports, and every one 22 that comes out of my office, if the person is wearing 23 clothing and we have the clothing, in the autopsy report 24 will not only be a description of the body, but will be a 25 description of the clothing, and whether there are Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 4561 1 corresponding defects or noncorresponding defects in that 2 clothing. 3 MR. DOUGLAS MULDER: Thank you, 4 Doctor. 5 Mr. Shook will have some questions for 6 you. 7 8 9 CROSS EXAMINATION 10 11 BY MR. TOBY SHOOK: 12 Q. Dr. DiMaio, it's my understanding you 13 are the chief medical examiner of San Antonio? 14 A. Yes, sir. 15 Q. Okay. And additionally, you make 16 extra money coming in and testifying at -- out of other 17 jurisdictions? 18 A. Right. I am not here as -- in my 19 official capacity as chief medical examiner. I am here 20 on my own time, compensatory time, and this is what I do, 21 you know, it's work on the side. 22 Q. And when you are testifying as an 23 expert, for instance, today, how much -- what is your fee 24 that you charge for that? 25 A. It depends on how far I have to go and Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 4562 1 it depends on how long, it depends on how much time. 2 Q. In this particular case? 3 A. I think my total bill, when I submit 4 it, is going to be about fifteen hundred dollars. 5 Q. Okay. And, you, in recent years 6 testified for, as I said, the defense in cases such as 7 this, haven't you? 8 A. Yes, most of my testimony is for the 9 prosecution in Bexar County, obviously, because that is

10 where my job is. And then I -- on private, I do about

11 half the time for the prosecution and half the time for

12 defense. This Friday I was testifying for the

13 prosecution in Florida, and Tuesday I am testifying for

14 the defense.

15 Q. A medical examiner is not supposed to

16 be biased one way or the other; is that right, Dr.

17 DiMaio?

18 A. That's correct.

19 Q. You just, you get the body in and you

20 do the autopsy, and you testify to questions asked about

21 what you found; is that right?

22 A. Right. And that is what I'm doing

23 here. I am just testifying to my scientific observations

24 of the wounds in this case.

25 Q. And, you have testified for Mr. Mulder

Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 4563

1 before, haven't you?

2 A. When he was a district attorney, yes,

3 and also when he was in private practice.

4 Q. How many times have you testified for

5 him since he has been in private practice, would you say?

6 A. Maybe four or five times.

7 Q. Okay. And have you consulted with him

8 on other cases?

9 A. Well, he's shown me occasionally a

10 case or two, and I have told him things.

11 Q. Did you make any report in regards to

12 this case?

- 13 A. No, sir.
- 14 Q. Any notes in regards to this case?

15 A. Just this sheet right here. If you

16 want to take a look at it.

17 Q. And then the -- the only other items

18 you looked at were the photographs?

19 A. And the medical records.

20 Q. And the medical records.

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. Did you look at all of the medical

23 records?

24 A. What? Well, on my testimony. I've

25 also -- I also have here some testimony by Dr.

Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 4564

1 Townsend-Parchman, but I'm not using any of that. Do you

2 want to take a look?

3 Q. Yes. But you had the Baylor medical

4 records to look at; is that right?

5 A. Yes, sir.

6 Q. Okay. And is that -- and then you had

- 7 some photographs. When is the first time you looked at
- 8 these photographs?
- 9 A. When I was originally given them by --
- 10 it was by Mr. Parks.
- 11 Q. Okay. You have not interviewed anyone
- 12 else in regards to your testimony or opinions?
- 13 A. No, sir.
- 14 Q. Have not talked to Dr. Santos or Dr.
- 15 Dillawn or any of the nurses at Baylor, have you?
- 16 A. No, I have just read his medical
- 17 records and such, yes.
- 18 Q. Okay. And you said that you worked on
- 19 several cases where people have committed self-inflicted
- 20 wounds to try to, I guess, what, cover their tracks or
- 21 throw off blame on them?
- 22 A. Yes, sir.
- 23 Q. Situations like that?
- 24 A. Yes, sir.
- 25 Q. So you do see that from time to time,
- Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 4565
- 1 don't you? People will go to the trouble of actually
- 2 having a self-inflicted wound to try to shove blame off
- 3 on them?
- 4 A. Yes, sir.
- 5 Q. Or point it in another direction?
- 6 A. Yes, sir.
- 7 Q. I guess, in your line of work, it
- 8 never ceases to amaze you what people can be capable of?
- 9 A. Yes, sir.
- 10 Q. Okay. Now, you say that -- well, let
- 11 me start this way. You talk about --
- 12 A. Excuse me.
- 13 Q. Yes, sir.
- 14 A. Are you through with my material, or
- 15 do you want to look through it?
- 16 Q. Well, I was going to look at here in a
- 17 second.
- 18 A. Okay. That is fine.
- 19 Q. Would it be better --
- 20 A. No, no, no. Go ahead and look at it.
- 21 Q. I'll leave it with you in case you
- 22 need to refer to it.
- 23 A. Okay. My piece of paper.
- 24
- 25 THE COURT: Can you all hear him okay?

Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 4566

1 THE JURORS: Yes.

2 THE COURT: Thank you. All right.

3

4 BY MR. TOBY L. SHOOK:

5 Q. Now, as far as the seriousness of the

6 defendant's wounds, Dr. DiMaio, wouldn't the surgeons who

7 actually performed the surgery on her, be a better judge

8 of how serious those injuries were?

9 A. Well, yes, sir. And that is why I'm

10 using their description that it went down to the carotid

11 sheath. If you are down to the carotid sheath, you are

12 within one or two millimeters of the carotid artery.

13 And then, of course, the medical

14 records, also -- I'm answering you now -- all the medical

15 records also show the hemoglobin has dropped by two

16 milligrams. So --

17 Q. But would you agree, Doctor, that the

18 surgeons who actually performed the surgery would be a

19 better judge to how serious their injuries -- or her

20 injuries were?

21 A. They might be, yes, sir.

22 Q. Well, they were there, weren't they?

23 A. Yes, sir, but I don't know what -- but

24 I mean, you know, it's like saying, someone shot at me

25 with a .44 magnum and it missed me, so therefore, it

Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 4567

1 wasn't very serious.

2 Q. Doctor, that is not the question I

3 asked you. They were there, weren't they?

4 A. Right, yes, sir, they were.

5 Q. Okay. They performed the surgery on

6 her neck, didn't they, Dr. DiMaio?

7 A. Yes, sir. And I'm basing my opinion

8 on their description of it.

9 Q. They saw the wound opened and operated

10 on it?

11 A. Yes, sir.

12 Q. So wouldn't they be the better judge

13 of just how serious that injury was?

14 A. Yes, sir.

15 Q. Okay. Now, as far as your opinion

16 about the defendant self-inflicting these wounds, are you

17 saying that it is impossible, that it couldn't have

18 happened?

19 A. No. What I'm saying is, that based

20 upon their location and their path, and the nature of the
21 wounds, it is more probable, the term I used, that it's
22 inflicted by someone else. Anything is possible, but I
23 am saying in this case, it's not probable.
24 Q. Okay. And as far as the neck wound,
25 you were talking about -- well, how would you describe
Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter
4568

1 the neck wound? Is it -- it's a pretty long wound, I

2 guess, wouldn't you say?

3 A. It looks to be about three inches or

4 so, the primary wound.

5 Q. Okay. Have you actually gotten to

6 examine her scar?

7 A. No.

8 Q. Okay. Would that help you in some of

9 your opinions, if you got to look close at the scar?

10 A. It doesn't make any difference because

11 it is pictured in the photographs.

12 Q. Okay. So those would be fine for you?

13 A. Yes, sir.

14 Q. Okay. You said -- do you have any

15 opinion as to how fast that wound would bleed out? You

16 were talking about when Mr. Mulder was finishing these --

17 what did you call them? Langer's lines?

18 A. The Langer's lines, yes, sir.

19 Q. Did that make a difference in this

20 case, or do you have an opinion as to how fast the neck

21 wound might bleed?

22 A. No, sir. All I know is that, you

23 know, she lost two milligrams -- two grams of hemoglobin.

24 Q. If that neck was cut, or when it was

25 cut, would you expect it to bleed pretty quickly?

Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter

4569

1 A. It would begin bleeding fairly

2 quickly, within 30 seconds to a minute, yes, sir.

3 Q. Would a neck wound like that bleed a

4 lot, have a lot of blood coming out of it?

5 A. Under most conditions, it would bleed

6 a lot, yes, sir.

7 Q. Okay. And, how would you describe the

8 position of this wound on the neck. Is it -- I mean,

9 let's say, she didn't survive, she had died. How would

10 you describe it in an autopsy?

11 A. An incised wound.

12 Q. Okay. And what position would you say

13 it was on the neck?

14 A. Okay. It's on the -- okay, it would 15 be an incised wound of the anterior aspect of the neck, 16 beginning, say, this is -- I'm just throwing numbers out 17 saying --18 Q. Sure. 19 A. -- 2 inches to the right of the 20 midline, above -- say an inch or two above the clavicle, 21 the collarbone and running downward and medially, that is 22 towards the center of the body, crossing the midline and 23 extending towards the medial end, that is the inner end 24 of the left collarbone. And the incised wound extends 25 down through the muscle, up to the carotid sheath. Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 4570 1 Q. Okay. How about the angle? How 2 severe an angle is the neck wound? 3 A. What do you mean, how severe an angle? 4 Q. Well, is it, like, vertical, oblique, 5 horizontal? 6 A. It's an oblique. It's running 7 downward from right to left. 8 Q. As far as the neck wound goes, would 9 you say it was a pretty long wound? 10 A. Well --11 Q. I think it's in the medical --12 A. It's a couple of inches, right. I 13 think it says 7.5 centimeters or so. Let me see how long 14 is this drawing? 15 Q. I thought I saw nine millimeters. 16 A. Nine centimeters?

17 Q. Or centimeters, I'm not sure.

18 A. Okay. Nine centimeters then would be

19 approximately four and a half inches. No, let me see,

20 no. It's three and a half inches, that is what I said.

21 Okay. It's 2.5 centimeters per inch and 10 centimeters

22 would be four inches.

23 Q. Okay.

24 A. So, it's a little less than four

25 inches.

Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 4571

1 Q. A little less then four inches.

2 A. Yes, sir.

3 Q. And looking at the photograph here in

4 28-B, it covers most of the front of the neck, I guess,

5 wouldn't you say?

6 A. It begins to the right of the midline,

7 runs downward onto the upper chest, right. Yes, sir, so

8 that is the primary one.

9 Q. So we're talking about all down the

10 front of the neck? Starting at the top right and going

11 down?

12 A. Yes, sir.

13 Q. Now, you can't say, or maybe you can,

14 if it started here or there? I mean, at which end it

15 starts, the cut? Can you tell us which end, just looking

16 at it?

17 A. No.

18 Q. So it could go this way or that way?

19 A. You could in theory say, it went up

20 this way. But of course, the problem there is if you are

21 trying to say it was self-inflicted, it becomes even more

22 difficult.

23 Q. Now Doctor, are you saying that the

24 defendant could not take this knife --- oh, I think we --

25 she could cut her own neck with this knife, couldn't she?

Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter

4572

1 A. Well, I said it's possible, but

2 improbable due to the -- if you look at it, see how it

3 comes down and then skips and then down.

4 Q. Well, that is if you take it through

5 that that is one long, continuous cut, right?

6 A. Yes, sir, and it lines up, and it's

7 consistent with it. Down, then you come, as you're

8 coming, then you come back and put your chest out and 9 then it catches it.

10 Q. Well, I don't want to use this knife

11 on myself, obviously. Let's try to measure it up here.

12 But there is nothing --

13 A. It would settle the problem, how fast

14 the bleeding was, you know.

15 Q. Yeah. All right. Well, I don't think

16 I will be demonstrating it. Maybe Mr. Mulder could come

17 up here and do that.

18

19 MR. DOUGLAS MULDER: Hand me the

20 knife, I'll do it.

21

22 BY MR. TOBY L. SHOOK:

23 Q. But there is nothing -- nothing that

24 would prevent her from taking that knife, if she wanted

25 to, and cutting across here?

Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter

4573

1 A. That's correct. Then she would have

2 to cut again, then she would have to change hands.

3 Q. Yes. And then do --

4 A. Turn her arm like that.

5 Q. Yeah.

6 A. But, what I'm saying is, it's

7 improbable.

8 Q. It's improbable?

9 A. Yes, because people who we've seen and

10 who have had incised, who do try to do that, do the same

11 thing, they always use the dominant hand, the right hand.

12 It's so ingrained that you don't even think about it.

13 Q. That is what people usually do?

14 A. Right. These people are, you know --

15 Q. Okay. But there is nothing preventing

16 the --

17

18 MR. DOUGLAS MULDER: Excuse me.

19 Excuse me. If you just will let him answer.

20 THE WITNESS: These people, no insult

21 to the defendant, but they're a little better -- they

22 were better educated than her and they are familiar with

23 medical things and they may even be familiar with

24 forensics, which I seriously doubt that she is.

25

Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 4574

1 BY MR. TOBY L. SHOOK:

2 Q. But there would be nothing preventing

3 the defendant from -- take the knife with the left hand,

4 stabbing it right there in the right arm. She could do

5 that, couldn't she?

6 A. That's what I said. I said it's

7 possible, but not probable.

8 Q. Well, in fact, there were two wounds

9 there on the right arm, aren't there?

10 A. Right.

11 Q. One is much smaller?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. Didn't even require any sutures or

14 anything. This wound we're talking about right here?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. And, is this wound kind of right here,

17 Doctor, would you say in the middle of the forearm or

18 near the elbow?

19 A. It's on -- it's approaching the side

20 of the arm.

21 Q. Okay. And this other one is right

22 above it?

23 A. Right.24 Q. Okay.25 A. It's actually a little further towardsSandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter4575

1 the finger.

2 Q. You talk about hesitation wounds, that

3 is when a person might work up enough courage, or testing

4 out, for instance, sometimes you get suicides, they might

5 cut a little bit before they make the big cut. Is that

6 right?

7 A. Hesitation marks are associated with

8 incised wounds, right. Cuts where they start to make a

9 cut and it hurts, and then they start and it hurts, so

10 you will see a number of smaller wounds.

11 Q. This smaller wound we see here could

12 be consistent with sort of a hesitation wound, couldn't

13 it?

14 A. You could say that if you think

15 it's -- if you think they are self-inflicted. Or, if

16 it's not self-inflicted, it's just a small stab wound.

17 Q. Right. It could go either way? But

18 it could be consistent with someone stabbing their arm

19 and then stabbing it with greater force right below it.

20 A. Right. What I am talking about is

21 medical probability. I'm not talking about possibility.

22 Q. And, again, as far as the angle goes,

23 right-handed, I mean, do you think it's real difficult

24 just to do that?

25 A. It actually is.

Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 4576

1 Q. Well, I'm doing it, aren't I?

2 A. Yes, I know.

3 Q. Okay.

4 A. But well, okay. Never mind.

5 Q. Okay.

6 A. It's difficult, but then again, okay,

7 so you do it this way, which is difficult, it's easier

8 just to go this way, and most people would go this way.

9 Why go this way? Why do it difficult?

10 First of all, if you're going to cut

11 yourself and you know it's going to hurt and everything,

12 why do it the hard way? Why not just go that way?

13 You are saying she went that way, then

14 put the knife in her other hand and then stabbed herself.

15 Q. Could do it? Could happen though?

16 A. It could happen, but --

18 physically impossible to do that? 19 A. It's not possible (sic) -- it's not 20 impossible, I said it's not probable. 21 Q. As far as that blunt trauma goes, that 22 is severe blunt trauma; is it not? 23 A. Yes. sir. 24 Q. And the bruising that you see there, 25 you said -- could that be consistent with just being two Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 4577 1 days old? 2 A. It looks to be a couple of days old. 3 That's all I will say. You can't date it any better. 4 Q. You can't come to dating them real 5 close, can you, Doctor? 6 A. No. sir. 7 Q. If this photograph was taken on the 8 10th, it's possible that injury could have happened on 9 the 8th? 10 A. It's possible, yes, sir. 11 Q. Okay. This bruise is still -- well, 12 somewhat crimson here on this. 13 A. Yes, sir. 14 Q. Which shows it's a more recent bruise; 15 is that right? 16 A. Well, I wouldn't say that. I mean, I 17 have said that it can, so I wouldn't push my luck. 18 Q. Okay. 19 A. Okay. With the coloration. 20 Q. And blunt trauma is caused when 21 something strikes the skin very hard; is that right? 22 A. Yes, sir. 23 Q. Okay. And you have looked at -- it 24 could be like you say, people oftentimes use a bat, 25 right? Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 4578 1 A. Yeah, I just used it because everyone 2 talks about a bat, but it could be anything hard. 3 Q. Does it look like there might be some

17 Q. Nothing could stop her and it's not

4 kind of pattern to these abrasions?

5 A. The only thing that I saw that

6 suggested a pattern of some sort was those little marks

7 over there, but I'm not going to commit myself.

8 Q. Okay. But this could possibly have a

9 pattern, what you see here, these red --

10 A. It could be something, right.

11 Q. Okay. And a pattern can be caused

12 when someone, I don't know, well, you tell the jurors how

13 a pattern can show up on skin.

14 A. A pattern indicates that the surface

15 that -- impacting was not smooth. I mean, there was some

16 irregularity on it.

17 Q. A brick, something like that could

18 leave a pattern?

19 A. Yes, sir, anything with a little

20 irregularity on it.

21 Q. Okay. And wherever it strikes the

22 skin, it might leave an abrasion to the skin? Or --

23 A. Well, only if you hit it on the side,

24 you have to hit the edge.

25 Q. Okay. And you can see, possibly, you

Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 4579

1 don't know, but possibly that's what we see here on the

2 forearm?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. These marks?

5 A. There's three or four marks there and

6 I don't know what they are, they may be abrasions and

7 such, but, it's too slim a thing to hang your hat on, I

8 mean.

9 Q. Right.

10 A. Mix up what I'm saying, but, let's put

11 it this way, it's there, the significance, I'm not sure.

12 Q. Well, on Defendant's Exhibit 86, do

13 you also see maybe a similar-type abrasion?

14 A. Yes, sir.

15 Q. Okay. And on, I think, it's 52-E, you

16 have already pointed out this area.

17 A. Right.

18 Q. But also, right along in there, is

19 there also an area?

20 A. Well, I'm talking about the same

21 thing.

22 Q. All right. All that area. And this

23 bruising, obviously, goes from here to here?

24 A. Yes, sir.

25 Q. More on inside; is that right?

Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 4580

1 A. Yes, sir.

2 Q. Again, looking at it from the other

3 point of view, if you wanted to self-inflict those

4 wounds, you would just have to take an object and hit the

5 inside of your arm; is that right? 6 A. Interesting, it's again, with the 7 non-dominant hand, yes, sir. 8 Q. If you wanted to do it. Or you could 9 just take your arm against the wall and whack it real 10 hard, couldn't you? 11 A. Not -- the wall wouldn't work because 12 your hand would hit also. 13 Q. Your hand would hit? Okay. But you 14 could do it if you wanted to? 15 A. It's possible. It would be very hard. 16 Q. But again, like you said, in your line 17 of work you see people do all kinds of things? 18 A. Occasionally. 19 Q. You didn't get any information in the 20 medical records that Mrs. Routier had any blunt force 21 trauma to her torso, did you? 22 A. No. 23 Q. To her head or face? 24 A. That's correct. There's photographs 25 of the face and then part of, well, just her upper Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 4581

1 extremities, upper chest.

2 Q. Okay. This -- getting back to the

3 neck wound again, it's almost four inches across and

4 extends across the front of the neck; is that right?

5 A. No, it four inches long. It begins in

6 the neck and then runs down onto the chest.

7 Q. Okay. Wouldn't you consider that, as

8 far as a neck wound, a pretty long wound?

9 A. Four inches is fairly long, yes, sir.

10 Q. Okay. And is it just one, is it just

11 one wound? The primary one we are talking about on the

12 neck, is that made with one swipe of the knife?

13 A. The only description says, it says one

14 wound, so that's the only thing. But, it's all been

15 sewed up at that point.

16 Q. Okay. Well, looking at the photos and

17 what the description is from the medical reports, that's

18 what it shows? It shows one long --

19 A. It shows a single swipe, yes, sir.

20 Q. Okay. Now, you gave an example of --

21 well, usually, when you see someone that has been

22 attacked from the front, frontal attack to the neck with,

23 let's say with a knife or sharp instrument?

24 A. Yes, sir.

25 Q. Those wounds inflicted are usually

Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 4582

1 short, are they not?

2 A. Yes, sir.

3 Q. Okay. Here we have a more long,

4 continuous wound?

5 A. Well, okay.

6 Q. Is that different?

7 A. By short, most -- okay, if you are

8 talking about incised wounds of the neck, generally, they

9 run about that size which would probably be about three

10 or four -- three or four inches, you know, three or four

11 inches for a neck wound, could be called short. I mean,

12 they are not going to be one-inch wounds, obviously, they

13 are going to be a couple of inches.

14 Q. Well, just a moment ago you said you

15 would consider it long, did you not?

16 A. Yeah, it's long. It's not short --

17 but when you ask me about short wounds to the neck, I'm

18 talking three or four inches, too. I mean, I'm

19 talking -- a long wound to the neck is when somebody gets

20 someone behind you and runs it completely around, so you

21 are talking about six or seven inches.

22 But slash wounds of the neck typically

23 run like this, because what happens is they will slash

24 down like this, and so you will see it running about that

25 length. But a long wound would be if you're cutting

Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 4583

1 someone's throat from ear to ear.

2 Q. Now, defensive wounds, you said that

3 you usually see those on the palms of the hand, don't 4 you?

5 A. No, I said the original description of

6 them is on the palms of the hand, but you will get them

7 on the palms of the hands, and on the back of the

8 forearms, even on the back of the other arms. We have

9 had people lying on the ground who have put their legs up

10 and have gotten them actually in their legs.

11 All that a defense wound means, is

12 that it is a wound incurred, in an extremity, in an

13 attempt to ward off an attacker.

14 Q. And it's just natural to put your

15 hands up and that kind of thing, to block off blows,

16 knife or blunt trauma?

17 A. Yes, sir.

18 Q. And you will often see, for instance,

19 in a knife attack, wounds to the palms of the hand?

20 A. Well, the fingers and palms, yes, sir. 21 Q. And they can be quite deep? 22 A. They can be deep, yes, sir. 23 Q. Cut to the bone often, don't they? 24 A. They can be, yes, sir. 25 Q. Now, this particular wound to Mrs. Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 4584 1 Routier's hand, that is not a very deep wound, is it? 2 A. No, it's a very superficial -- there's 3 actually three of them, but I think it's probably one 4 swipe, but they're very superficial. 5 Q. Extremely superficial? 6 A. Yes, sir. 7 Q. Okay. Also, many times on your 8 defensive wounds, you see them -- what part of the arm do 9 you call this? 10 A. You talking about plexor surface? 11 Q. I guess so. If that is the word I'm 12 looking for. 13 A. Yes. 14 Q. You put your arm up. You will see 15 cuts across that way in defensive wounds? 16 A. Actually, most defensive wounds from 17 knives are in the back, they are not on this surface. 18 In fact, that's the way you can tell 19 people come in with scars. People come in with scars on 20 this surface, you think they may have tried suicide. 21 This surface, you think they have been in knife fights. 22 So --23 Q. What's this surface called? 24 A. That would be the posterior aspect, 25 back of the forearm. Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 4585 1 Q. And what is this surface called? 2 A. Plexus. Okay. It's this surface, 3 plexor surface. 4 Q. And you are saying you don't see 5 defensive wounds on the plexor surface? 6 A. Well, you can see -- what I'm saying 7 is, you're asking me where they usually occur. And they 8 are classically described as being on the back and not 9 here. 10 These suicidal wounds are described as 11 being on this surface. Homicidal, that is where people 12 attack you, on the back.

13 Q. Okay. Usually, in cases of homicide,

14 the assailant doesn't leave the weapon at the scene, does 15 he?

16 A. Yeah, that's correct.

17 Q. Okay. Another area I wanted to ask

18 you: Did you look at the autopsy reports on the two 19 boys?

20 A. I just briefly went through them, but

21 since I didn't intend to testify in anything about them.

22 Q. I just had one quick question about

23 that. As far as stab wounds in this case or any other

24 case, the angle, how it goes in the body. Let me show

25 you this one. You see this stab wound number 1?

Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 4586

1 A. Yes, sir.

2 Q. It shows the knife coming across this

3 way into the torso. You can't tell from an autopsy if

4 the person was laying on their back and they were being

5 stabbed at this angle, if they were moving around and

6 maybe the knife went in that way; is that right? Do you

7 understand what I am saying?

8 A. Well, I think so. What you're saying

9 is, that just by examining the stab wound alone, you

10 can't say necessarily whether they are standing up or

11 lying down. Is that the question?

12 Q. Right.

13 A. The answer is yes.

14 Q. And even if they were lying down, they

15 could be moving around during the attack when the knife

16 is going in?

17 A. Yes, sir.

18 Q. Okay. And as far as blood on the

19 knife, I think that it's your understanding that three

20 people could have been cut with this knife; is that

21 right?

22 A. Yes, sir.

23 Q. Now, if blood of one of the children

24 was not found on this knife, that is not -- you can't

25 say, well, then this knife wasn't used to do the killing,

Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 4587

1 could you?

2 A. No.

3 Q. Oftentimes --

4 A. It's only significant if you find

5 blood, it means something; if you don't find it, it

6 doesn't mean anything.

7 Q. When you stab someone in the body,

8 skin might wipe it off, an organ might wipe it off, that 9 kind of thing?

10 A. Yes, sir.

11 Q. Okay. As far as -- here, let me give

12 you your notes back. I don't want to forget those.

13 A. Okay. Thank you.

14 Q. The blunt trauma that the defendant

15 received, you wouldn't expect her to sleep through that,

16 would you?

17 A. No.

18 Q. Okay. And that is going to hurt when

19 you get hit like that?

20 A. Yes, sir.

21 Q. And, is it a natural reaction, would

22 you say, that the person that is getting hit with blunt

23 trauma, they are going to yell out?

24 A. Well, I would assume -- well, I don't

25 know, I have not beaten anybody, so I can't say. I would

Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter

4588

1 think it would depend on the person, I mean what is going

2 on, I mean, you know.

3 Q. Okay. Nothing --

4 A. I think that is outside of my area.

5 Q. Nothing would prevent a person from

6 yelling out if they were suddenly attacked in their home

7 and someone started hitting them with a stick, brick or

8 whatever?

9 A. I guess not, no, sir.

10 Q. And certainly, the defendant, when she

11 is stabbed on the throat, wouldn't sleep through that,

12 would you think?

13 A. No, sir.

14 Q. I mean, they are going to wake up when

15 someone starts cutting you with a knife?

16 A. Well, I think she would have to have

17 been moving by virtue, as I said, of going backward,

18 because I think that is one slice wound.

19 Q. Okay. And if her children were in the

20 same room and stabbed, you wouldn't expect her to sleep

21 through that either, would you?

22 A. Well, depends.

23 Q. Okay.

24 A. It depends on how violent the attack

25 was and it depends on how hard the person sleeps, but

Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter

4589

1 most -- under most circumstances, you would think that

2 they wouldn't sleep through it.

3 Q. Well, if you had information that they

4 were a light sleeper and that they had taken amphetamines

5 that day, and the amphetamines in fact, are in their

6 blood when they were taken to the hospital, you wouldn't

7 think they would sleep through that, would you?

8 A. I would say under most circumstances,

9 right. I think phentermine, not amphetamines.

10 Q. Well, what is that?

11 A. Phentermine is a -- the toxicology

12 report, the only drug present being phentermine, not

13 amphetamines. Phentermine is essentially a weight

14 reducing drug.

15 Q. Okay. It's certainly not something

16 that will put you to sleep though, right?

17 A. No.

18 Q. And, if one of your children were

19 about as far from I am to you right now, the one that had

20 all of the stab wounds in the back, Damon, you wouldn't

21 expect her to sleep through that, would you?

22 A. Again, as I said, under most

23 circumstances, no, sir.

24 Q. Okay. And if the other child was

25 about from, about this distance, say about five feet, you Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter

4590

1 wouldn't expect her to sleep through that either, would 2 you?

3 A. Under most circumstances, no, sir.

4 Q. Okay. And did you review the wounds

5 that those children received, Dr. DiMaio?

6 A. I looked, again, as I say, I looked at

7 them, I didn't pay that much attention.

8 Q. Those were obviously deep, penetrating

9 wounds to the trunk, were they not?

10 A. Obviously, yes, sir.

11 Q. Okay. What do you think happened

12 first, the blunt trauma, or the cut to the neck?

13 A. It would be speculation on my part. I

14 can't answer that.

15 Q. Okay. And would you say, Dr. DiMaio,

16 that the wounds that the children received, the deep,

17 penetrating wounds to their trunk areas, are extremely

18 different from the type of incised wounds that she

19 received?

20 A. Well, by definition, a stab wound and

21 an incised wound are different things. And so the

22 incised wound is inflicted from a swipe with a knife,

23 while stab wounds is with the tip end, yes, sir.24 Q. You have come across, I think, you

25 have, in one of your books that I have looked at, you Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 4591

1 have a section about children that are killed, homicides? 2 A. Yes, sir.

3 Q. And, you talk about, I think it's in

4 the miscellaneous section, that sometimes children are

5 killed, they are shot or stabbed or things like that?

6 A. Most killed -- most children are

7 murdered within the first two or three years of life --

8 usually, within the first two years of life or the first 9 year.

10 Q. Okay. And again -- well, let me make

11 sure I get the quote right.

12 In talking about these miscellaneous

13 deaths where children are stabbed or clubbed or shot, I

14 believe that you write that, "Homicides are committed by

15 sane individuals, for reasons that may or may not be

16 apparent. There are two groups in this category: First

17 are violent deaths, which while no attempt is made to

18 conceal the cause of death, the perpetrator will attempt

19 to make the death appear to be an accident, or due to

20 another individual. Thus, the perpetrator will relate

21 that a child accidentally drowned in the bathtub or fell

22 in a river. There may be claims that a child was

23 kidnapped by a bearded or masked individual."

24 A. Yes, sir.

25 Q. So you have had -- seen situations

Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 4592

1 where it's a very violent death to a child and the

2 perpetrator might say, well, just try to blame it on

3 someone else?

4 A. Oh, yeah.

5 Q. Okay. I don't know if I caught this

6 right. Did you say people just -- people can commit

7 suicide by cutting their own throat, can't they? You

8 have seen that, haven't you?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. And when they do that, they do one

11 long continuous cut, don't they?

12 A. Usually what they do is they will

13 start high up on the side and they will cut down this way

14 and then they will stop about here.

15 Q. Okay.

16 A. If they are right-handed, you know.

17 If left-handed, then they will start and they will come 18 down. It will be cut through, it will start up high, 19 below the ear and then cut down this way. 20 Q. Starts up high and then comes down at 21 an angle? 22 A. Yeah, and then loops across the other 23 side. 24 Q. And then all the way across the neck? 25 A. Yes, sir. Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 4593 1 Q. Okay. 2 A. Well, up to a certain point. Usually, 3 they only get here. Because what happens is, once you 4 get to this point, it becomes difficult to angle the 5 knife. 6 Q. Thank you, Doctor. 7 8 MR. TOBY L. SHOOK: That's all I have. 9 THE COURT: Mr. Mulder? 10 11 12 **13 REDIRECT EXAMINATION** 14 15 BY MR. DOUGLAS MULDER: 16 Q. Doctor, just a thing or two. Are you 17 familiar with amnesia following a traumatic event? 18 19 MR. TOBY L. SHOOK: Judge --20 THE COURT: Sustain the objection. 21 705 hearing. The doctor has testified as to what the 22 basis of his testimony is going to be. 23 Move on to the next question. 24 MR. DOUGLAS MULDER: Yes, sir. 25 Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 4594 **1 BY MR. DOUGLAS MULDER:** 2 Q. Doctor, there is a Polaroid photograph 3 up there, that was taken by a member, I believe it's 4 Beddingfield of the Rowlett Police Department. 5 A. Yes, sir. 6 Q. It has some writing on the back. 7 A. Yes, sir. 8 Q. Do you see anything in that photograph 9 that is dated, I think at 16:05 on June the 6th of '96,

10 do you see anything to indicate bruising of that

11 particular arm?

12 A. There is a suggestion of some

13 discoloration below this wound over here.

14 Unfortunately, because it's out of

15 focus, you know, it's difficult to say.

16 Q. Okay. It would be somewhat unusual to

17 batter someone in an isolated incident, just on the arms,

18 wouldn't it?

19 A. You mean in defensive?

20 Q. No, just to -- the bruising here?

21 A. Um-hum. (Witness nodding head

22 affirmatively.)

23 Q. It's likely that this occurred at the

24 same time that the stab wounds were inflicted, is it not?

25 A. Yes, I mean, right, yes. I thought I

Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter

4595

1 had said that. Yes, sir.

2 Q. Okay.

3 A. All I said was, I couldn't say whether

4 it occurred immediately before or after. There is no way 5 to say.

6 Q. And they have quite a sensitive test

7 now, to determine the presence and absence of blood, even

8 though the instrument has been wiped clean, don't they?

9 A. Right. You can do a test that would

10 identify the blood. You might not be able to type it,

11 but you could say that there was hemoglobin present, or

12 material that tests positive for hemoglobin.

13 Q. One last thing: You have testified

14 before lunch that, in your opinion, those bruises are

15 consistent with Mrs. Routier having been beat violently

16 with a blunt instrument on or about both of her arms. It

17 would not be unlikely to also receive an injury to the

18 head during that beating, would it?

19 A. That's correct, yes, sir.

20

21 MR. DOUGLAS MULDER: I believe that's

22 all. Thank you.

23

24

25

Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 4596

1 RECROSS EXAMINATION

2

3 BY MR. TOBY L. SHOOK:

4 Q. But you saw nothing in the medical

5 records that showed any blunt force injury to the head, 6 did you?

7 A. No, not to the face. I mean, that

8 also includes the top and back covered by hair and there

9 is no mention in the records, and, of course, I can't see

10 it on any photographs.

11 Q. And no indication that anywhere in the

12 medical records that she complained about getting her

13 head whacked real hard?

14 A. That's correct.

15 Q. Okay. If you are going to get the

16 blunt trauma to the arm that is going to cause that kind

17 of damage, and you got hit in the head anywhere, it would

18 cause a pretty big knot, wouldn't it?

19 A. It may. I mean, you know, what we're

20 talking about is not a stationary -- it's not like you

21 are hitting a stationary object. You would have to say

22 that -- it's like, what's on one arm that person would be

23 moving trying to avoid it. So, it just depends on how

24 hard the impact is. I wouldn't rule it out, but I mean, 25 I can't say.

Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 4597

1 Q. Well, if a person got hit on the head,

2 as hard as they did on the arm obviously, that is going

3 to cause an injury, is it not?

4 A. Right. If that was the case, right.

5 But I'm saying, I can't, you know I cannot discuss

6 something that I don't know if it was there or not and

7 say how much force was used to produce a wound which may

8 or may not be there.

9 Q. Because you don't have evidence or

10 information that tells you that there was any injury like

11 that?

12 A. That's correct.

13

14 MR. TOBY SHOOK: Okay. That's all we

15 have, Judge.

16 MR. DOUGLAS MULDER: That's all we

17 have. May he be excused?

18 THE COURT: Any objection? All right.

19 Doctor, you are excused subject to

20 recall. You are instructed not to discuss your testimony

21 with anybody. If someone tries to talk to you, tell the

22 attorney for the side who called you. And, of course,

23 you are subject to recall.

24 THE WITNESS: Thank you, your Honor.

25 THE COURT: All right.

Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 4598

1 Your next witness. 2 MR. DOUGLAS MULDER: Dr. Lisa Clayton. 3 THE COURT: All right. 4 MR. TOBY SHOOK: Judge, could we 5 approach the bench? 6 7 (Whereupon, a short 8 discussion was held 9 at the side of the 10 bench, between the Court, 11 and the attorneys for 12 both sides in the case, 13 off the record, and outside 14 of the hearing of the 15 Jury, after which time, 16 the proceedings were 17 resumed on the record, 18 outside the hearing of 19 the jury as follows:) 20 21 THE COURT: All right. Ladies and 22 gentlemen, if you will step back to the jury room, 23 briefly, please.